

IN RE: THE NOMINATION PETITIONS OF

: ELECTION MATTER

BRAD WITMER AS A REPUBLICAN

: DOCKET NO:

CANDIDATE FOR STATE REPRESENTATIVE IN THE 41stLEGISLATIVE DISTRICT

% MD 202

PETITION TO SET ASIDE NOMINATING PETITIONS

AND NOW, come Petitioners, by their counsel, Lawrence M. Otter, Esquire, and file the within Petition and, in support thereof avers as follows:

- Exclusive jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Petition is vested in the Commonwealth Court of Pennsylvania by the provisions of the Pennsylvania Election Code, 25 P. S. § 2937, and the provisions of the Judicial Code, 42 Pa. C. S. A. § 764.
- 2. One Petitioner is David Dunmeyer who resides at 1665 Silver Spring Rd., Landisville, PA, 17538 and is a duly registered and enrolled Republican elector of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who votes and resides in the 41st Legislative District.
- 3. One Petitioner is Bruce Gadbois who resides at 207 E. New St.,

 Mountville, PA 17554 and is a duly registered and enrolled Republican elector of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who votes and resides in the 41st Legislative District.

FEB 2 0-2024

- 4. One Respondent is Brad Witmer, a candidate for State Representative in 41st Legislative District who as of February 13, 2024, allegedly resides at 686 Church St., Landisville, PA 17538.
- One Respondent is Al Schmidt, the Secretary of the Commonwealth, whose office is located at 305 North Office Building, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania.
- 6. On or about February 13, 2024, Nominating Petitions were filed with the Pennsylvania Department of State, Bureau of Elections, nominating Respondent, Brad Witmer, as a Republican candidate for State Representative in the 41st Legislative District.
- 7. The nominating Petitions are purported to consist of 11 petition pages and allegedly containing 323 lines of signatures of electors supporting the nomination of Respondent Brad Witmer.
- 8. Three Hundred (300) valid signatures of qualified electors who reside within the 41st Legislative District are required by statute, 25 P. S.
 §2872.1 (14) to support the Nominating Petitions of Brad Witmer in the Primary Election scheduled for April 23, 2024.
- The Nominating Petitions of Respondent Brad Witmer are invalid and inadequate in that they contain less than 300 valid signatures and because

of various inadequacies and deficiencies as outlined in a spreadsheet attached hereto and incorporated as **Exhibit A.**

10. Service upon the candidate was effectuated pursuant to the Order of this Court by the posting of this petition on the Commonwealth Court Docket.

WHEREFORE, Petitioner prays this Honorable Court to set aside the Nominating Petitions of Respondent Brad Witmer since he lacks the minimum number of valid signatures (300) for the office of State Representative and to order that his name not appear on the ballot for nomination as the Republican Party candidate for State Representative in the 41st Legislative District.

Respectfully submitted,

WHENCE M. OTTER, ESQUIRE

ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONERS

PA ATTORNEY ID 31383

PO Box 575

Silverdale, PA 18962

267-261-2948

Email: <u>larryotter@hotmail.com</u>

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

IN RE: THE NOMINATION P BRAD WITMER AS A REPUB CANDIDATE FOR STATE RE IN THE 41 st LEGISLATIVE D	BLICAN PRESENTATIVE	:	CKET NO:
	ORDER		
AND NOW, this	day of		, 2024, it is hereby
ORDERED that the Nominating	g Petitions of Brad V	Vitmer,	as a Candidate for
State Representative in the 41st	Legislative District l	be and l	hereby are stricken and
dismissed, and			
FU	RTHER ORDERE	D	
that the name of respondent Brac	l Witmer not appear	on the	ballot for the April 23
2024 Primary Election for the Re	epublican Party can	didate f	for State Representative
in the 41st Legislative District.			e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e e
	BY THE CO	URT	

J.

IN THE COMMONWEALTH COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA

IN RE: THE NOMINATION PETITIONS OF

: ELECTION MATTER

BRAD WITMER AS A REPUBLICAN

CANDIDATE FOR STATE REPRESENTATIVE : DOCKET NO: IN THE 41STLEGISLATIVE DISTRICT

MD 2024

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Lawrence M. Otter, Esquire, counsel for Petitioner, hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the within Petition with proposed order affixed thereto was duly served on February 20, 2024 upon the following:

BY HAND

Secretary of the Commonwealth 305 North Office Building Harrisburg, PA 17120-0029

> RENCE M. OTTER, ESQUIRE ATTORNEY FOR PETITIONERS

POBOX 575

SILVERDALE, PA 18962

267-261-2948

Email: larryotter@hotmail.com

EXHIBIT A

The objection petition shall specify objections to individual signature lines in nomination petitions or papers and these shall be set forth in an EXCEL® or other similar spreadsheet format. Objector may use the downloadable spreadsheet provided on the Court's website at: http://www.pacourts.us/courts/commonwealth-court/.

Spreadsheet columns shall include, for each challenged signature line on the nomination petition/paper: page number, line number, county, and the reason or reasons for each challenge. The spreadsheet shall designate the grounds for objection using the following abbreviations (challenge codes key):

NR –	Not Registered
NRA –	Not Registered at Address
NRCP-	Not Registered in Candidate's Party
NRD -	Not Registered in District
NRDS –	Not Registered on Date Signed
OC –	Out of County
ILL-	Illegible
LIO –	Line Information Omitted
DUP-	Duplicate
IHA –	Line Information in Hand of Another
N/I -	Nickname/Initial
PRI –	Printed Signature
DCS -	Defective Circulator Statement
SAC -	Signed After Circulator's Statement Dated
Other –	Any ground for objection not listed

above

SEE EXCEL SPREADSHEET FOLLOWING

58	57	56 0	2	53	52	51	50 49	; 4 8	47	46	45	t 4	1 2 £	\$ 4	\$; 39	38	37	36	35	¥	33	32	31	æ	29	28	27	26	24	23	22	21	20	19	18	17	15	14	13	12	= 0	9	ш	7	1	1 1	3	, <u>,</u>	
6	6	5 0	6	6	5	55 (<u>"</u>	, 5		4	4	4 4	4 4	4 4	4	4 4	4 4	3	3	<u>.</u>	ω	ωω	, 2	2	2	2	2	2 !	2	2	2	2	2	2	2 -	<u>,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,</u>	<u></u>	.	1	ь	٠,		-	Page Line	•	4. 7	. <u>ψ</u>	Indicate the ground or grounds that allegedly render the signature line invalid by inserting an "X" in the appropriate column (columns).	rections fo	Þ
8 Lan	7 Lan	6 ian	3 Lan	2 Lan	29 Lan	27 Lan	16 Lan 24 Lan	4 Lan	1 Lan	26 Lan	23 Lan	22 Lan	16 lar	8 Lancaster	4 Lan	3 Lan	1 Lan	19 Lan	9 Lan	6 Lan	5 Lan	4 Lan	26 Lan	22 Lan	19 Lan	18 Lan	11 Lan	9 Lan	8 Lar	6 Lan	5 Lan	4 Lan	3 Lan	2 Lan	1 Lar	27 Lancaster	23 Lan	21 Lan	20 Lan	17 Lancaster	16 Lan	12 Lancaster	2 Lan	.	766 110	Do not m	When "O	Indicate t	or complet	B
8 Lancaster	caster	Lancaster	caster	Lancaster	Lancaster	caster	Lancaster	caster	caster	caster	caster	Caster	Caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	Caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	caster	raster	caster	Lancaster	Lancaster	caster	caster	caster	caster	Lancaster	County	Jection of	ake any m	ther" (col	the ground	ting sprea	0
	1	+	×	-	×	+	+	<u> </u>		\vdash	+	+	$\frac{1}{2}$	+	\downarrow	+	\perp	+	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	\perp	+	+	+	H	<u> </u>	$\frac{1}{1}$	+	+	\downarrow	-	\prod	\parallel	+	$\frac{1}{2}$	+	+	\downarrow	H		\perp	+	+	NR.	Tedusinon	iarks in co	umn R) i	d or grour	dsheet:	
		+			Н	×	+	+	×	H	+	+	$\frac{1}{1}$	+	$\frac{1}{1}$	+	-	-		<u> </u>	+	+	\vdash	\vdash	F	<u> </u>	H	+	+	+			\prod	+	+	+	+	+		\prod	+	+	+	NRA	. Offerere.	lumns T t	s used, sp	ds that al	halleng	7
	×	+		-	H	+	+	×	H	H	+	+	+	×	+	+	+	-		-	-	+	-	_	-	H	\prod	+	+	+				+	>	*	+		H	H	+	+	+	NRCP	13 180 00.	hrough W	ecify the	egedly re	yni se ber	
H	+	+	-	-		×	+	+	H	H	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	H	-	\vdash	-	+	\vdash	-	-	-	+	+	+	<u> </u> -			+	_	+		-		$\frac{1}{1}$	+	+	+	P NRD	JW IVI US	ow for de	exact natu	nder the	alid comp	6
\vdash	1	+	+		H	+	+			$\mid \downarrow \mid$	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	H		\vdash	-	+		H	H		+	+					+	+	+	+	+	H		+	+	+	NRDS	1	siled dire	re of the	signature	ota the in	Ī
H		\dagger			\parallel	+	+	+	$\mid \mid$		+	+	+	+	+	+	+	+	H		+	+	+		+	-	\prod	+	+			\parallel		+	+	+	+	+	H	H	+	+	+	8	10110	ctions and	bjection	line invalir	formation	 -
						1	+	H		П	_		+			\dagger		-				\dagger	×		\vdash	\vdash		+	\dagger					+	-	+	+	+			1	+	+	IL	0.00	a legend	in the "De	by inser	indicated	Ļ
	×											+	×	+								T				\mid								1		†		×	\vdash		1	\dagger	+	ē		of the oh	scribe Oth	ting an "X"	for colur	<u> </u>
		T				1	1					1	1		\uparrow					Ī				T					1					1	1		1	T		Ħ	1	+	T	PUP	Specific	ection co	ner" cell (c	in the ar	ne A throu	F
												I			×	×					×				×	×			× >			×	×	××	*			×				××		DUP IHA N/I PRI	Grounds fr	2	olumn S).	propriate	J	3
×		×		×		;	×	Ĭ		×			×				×	×	×			×					×	×		×							××		×	×	×		×	Š	or Objecti			column (z
						_	\downarrow	<u> </u>		Ц	× ;		1	\downarrow	\perp	\downarrow	\downarrow	\downarrow	<u> </u>	1	\downarrow	\perp	\downarrow	\downarrow	L			 	\downarrow					\downarrow			1	\downarrow	L		\sqcup	\perp	\downarrow		9			columns (0
L						1	+	<u> </u>	igsqcup	Ц	_	1	_	1	\downarrow	1	\downarrow	+	<u> </u>	-	+	\downarrow	\downarrow	_	_	L		\downarrow	1				Ц	1		_	_	1			\dashv	+	_	S SO				D through R).	_	٦
L		-	-	-	H	1	×	-		H	4	×	+	+	+	\downarrow	+	+	+	-	+		-	×	_	+		-	× ;	< ×	×	×	×	× ;	× ,	×	+	×	1	\prod		+	+	SAC Ot				?	-	٥
		_		ļ_		_		<u> </u>		Ц	\perp	7	1	\downarrow	_	1	_	_	_	_	\downarrow	\downarrow	_	12	_	<u> </u>		\downarrow	-	-			0	-	0	_	\downarrow				Ц	\perp	_	Other						R
							Incorrect printed name	ا اسماما ا			91. 4-4	Non-sequential date												Non-sequential date	11 1-11				ate Changed	ate Changed	ate Changed	ate Changed	ate Changed	Date Changed	Changed	past petition		No printed name	,					Describe Other						S
							ame	_				ř												ñ				Ц	1						1	deadline														
		1	ļ			\downarrow	1	\downarrow			\perp	\downarrow	ļ.	\downarrow	1	_	\perp	<u> </u>	_	ļ	\downarrow	1	1	_	\downarrow	L		\prod	_					\downarrow			1		\downarrow		Ц	_	\downarrow	2/S						-
L			-				1				\sqcup	\downarrow	1	1	_	_	1	1	\perp	1	\downarrow	\downarrow	\downarrow	+	_	_			1	_	-			\dashv	1	\downarrow	\downarrow	\perp	\downarrow		\sqcup	_	\downarrow	v/s s/ct					\perp	c

112	110	109	107	<u></u>	1 1 2	103	102	100	99	98	96	95	94	8 4	3 9	8	89	88	87	g (5	2	83	82 9	2 88	79	78	77	76	75	1/3	72	77	70	68	67	g	65	2 2	2	61	60			
										11 11				Ī					10 10	1, 10		g	10	, ,		, s	٥	10.1	œ œ			2	~ a			J				6		rage 6	7	A
					T	П	52																																			5	3	В
						П	Lancaste	Lancaster	Lancaste	10 Lancaster	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	25 Lancaster	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	20 Lancaster 26 Lancaster	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancastr	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Lancaste	Callaty	T
									1	֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓	1	i.	7	֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓		"	ř	۱	-	֓֟֟֟֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֟֟֓֓֓֓֟֟֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֟֓֓֓֟֟	"	ir .	7	` ~	٦	"	֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֟֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֓֓֓֓	er "	* *	- *	1	-	֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֟֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֓֟֓֓֓֓	٦	1		"	1	ï	jr	4 -	1		C
			\parallel	\dagger	\dagger	П	+	+						×			$ \cdot $			+	\dagger		1	+	+	\prod	,	×	××	+	\parallel		\dagger	×		П	\dagger		-		×	× 2	20	D
			\dagger			\prod	\dagger	×						×		×			\dagger	+	\parallel	\prod	\dagger			$ \cdot $		×	+	\dagger	\parallel		\dagger	×	\prod	H	×		+			273	Z D	m
			\dagger	+	\dagger	\prod	\dagger	+	×	-	+		×	×	×	\dagger		1	\dagger	\dagger	×	×	×			\parallel		+	+	\dagger	\parallel	,	×	\dagger	×	\parallel	+		+			1	S. S.	
	+		\dagger	+-	\dagger	\parallel	\dagger	\dagger			+			+	\dagger			1	+		\dagger	\prod	\dagger	+	\dagger	\prod		×	\dagger	+			\dagger	+	\parallel	\parallel						28	Z	G
	\dagger		\dagger	+	\dagger		+	\dagger							\dagger				\dagger	1	+-		\dagger	\dagger	\dagger	\prod	П	\dagger	+	\dagger	\parallel		\dagger	+	+				1			ON CO	SUBIN	Ŧ
+	++		\dagger	\dagger	\dagger	\prod	\dagger	+						1	\dagger		H			+	\dagger	\prod	+	+	+-	\mathbf{H}		\dagger	+	\dagger	\parallel		\dagger	\dagger	\parallel	H	-	+	+	\dagger	\top	۶		-
\top	++	+	+	\dagger	\dagger	\parallel	+	\dagger		+					\dagger			1	\dagger	\dagger	+		1	+			\parallel	-	+	+	\parallel		\dagger	\dagger		Н		-				F	=	_
\dagger	$\dagger \dagger$			\dagger	\dagger	\parallel	×	+		+				+	\dagger	-			\dagger	\dagger	+					\parallel	$\mid \uparrow \mid$	+	+	+	\forall		+	\dagger	\prod	×		+	+			Ę	5	_
+	\parallel			+	+	\parallel	\dagger	\dagger		\dagger	\dagger			\dagger				1	\dagger	\dagger	+	\prod	\perp	+	+	H	$\mid \mid$	+	+	+	\forall	\parallel	-	+	++		+	+	+			Ç	Specifi	<u> </u> _
1	++		\dagger	\dagger	\dagger	H	+	+		\dagger	×	×		+	+			+	× >	•	H	\prod	+	+	+	×	×	+	\dagger	+	×	×	+	+	H	H	-	××	+			3	Specific Grounds for Objection	_
\dagger	\parallel		H	+	+-	\parallel	×	+		>	<			+	+	+	H	×	\dagger	×	-	H	>	<	×	H	H	+	+	×	\forall	\parallel	×	+	H		+	+	×	×		1/1	s for Obj	Z
	$\dagger \dagger$		+	\dagger	\dagger	H	+	+		×	+			\dagger	+	_	×	1	+	\dagger	H	H	+	+	+	H	$\mid \cdot \mid$	+	+	+	H	\vdash	+	+	H	H	+	+	+	+	\parallel	2	ection	0
+	\parallel		+		\dagger	H	+	\dagger		\dagger	+			+		+	H	1	\dagger	\dagger	+	H	+	+		H		+	+	+	H	$\parallel \parallel$	+	+	++	-	+	+	+			- 6	SOG	-
	+		+		+	H	+	+		+				+	+		H	+	+	+	+	H	+	+	+	H		+	+	+	H	\prod	+	+	H	H	+	+	+	+		ڔٞ	SAC	٥
\dagger	$\dagger \dagger$	+	+	+	\dagger	H	+	+		+	+					<u> </u>		1	+	+	H	H	+	×	+	H	H	+	+	+	++	+	+	+	H	H	\dagger	+	+	×		C	Q P	
-	+		H	+	+	H	+	+		+	+			+	+				+	+	+	H	+	Nor		\mathbb{H}	H	+	+	+	H	H	+	\downarrow	\coprod	H	\dashv	+	+	\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\				_
																								Non-sequential date																Multiple voters on line		Describe Other	Seriba Ot	
																								tial date																ers on lin		1	ğ	S
+	11	-	\coprod	\downarrow	+	\parallel	+	\downarrow		-	-			+	+				+	+	+	\vdash	1	\downarrow	-		\sqcup	\perp	$\frac{1}{1}$	\perp	\sqcup	\sqcup	+	+		$\left \cdot \right $	-	+	\downarrow	ē		1	s/s	L
+					_	\parallel	+	+		\downarrow				+	-				-	+	\downarrow	\prod	\downarrow	\downarrow	<u> </u>	\parallel	\coprod	_	_	\perp		\prod	\downarrow	+		\prod	\parallel	\downarrow	+				/s v/s	- -
	\parallel			-	-	\prod	4	\bot		-				1	-					+	\downarrow	\sqcup	\perp	\downarrow	\downarrow	\prod	\prod	\downarrow	\perp	_		\prod	\downarrow	\downarrow		\coprod	\sqcup	_	\downarrow	_				C
						Ш		\perp																\perp				\rfloor															s/cr v/cr	<